Economic Development Strategies to Promote Quality Child Care

2004

Linking Economic Development & Child Care Research Project

By Mildred Warner, Ph.D., Shira Adriano, Nikita Barai, Jenna Halas, Bjorn Markesson, Taryn Morrissey, and Wendy Soref

DEPARTMENT OF CITY AND REGIONAL PLANNING
Cornell Cooperative Extension
W. Stiles Hall, Cornell University
Ithaca, NY 14850-6701
http://economicdevelopment.cornell.edu
Acknowledgements

This report is part of the larger Cornell University Linking Economic Development and Child Care Research Project supported by the US Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Child Care Bureau research funds, and by the US Department of Agriculture Hatch Research Program administered by Cornell Agricultural Experiment Station. Funding for outreach is provided by the W.K. Kellogg Foundation in collaboration with Smart Start’s National Technical Assistance Center.

We would like to acknowledge the other members of the Cornell project team - David Kap, James Pratt, Karen Shelleyback, Caroline Marshall and Louise Stoney – for providing careful review of this economic development strategy guide. Special thanks to Rachel Maines for careful editing, and to Eric Forehand at Smart Start’s National Technical Assistance Center for design and layout.

Initial research and drafting of this document was conducted by Professor Warner’s Government Policy Workshop class at Cornell University. Students included Shira Agron, Nikiita Barai, Jenna Hallas, Taryn Morrissey, and Wendy Soreff.

The concepts included in this document were reviewed at a roundtable discussion in April 2004 attended by Marta Armstrong (Tomkins County Area Development); Carol Segars (New York State Child Care Coordinating Council); Joanne Florone (Tread Foundation); Jeane McPheters (Tomkins County Chamber of Commerce, Ithaca, NY); Michael Cubota (Alternatives Credit Union, Ithaca, NY); Sue Dale-Hall (Day Care & Child Development Council of Tompkins County, Ithaca, NY).

We would also like to thank the following external reviewers:
Marcia Martin (Oregon Child Care Information Partnership); Jan Weil (National Economic Development and Law Center, Oakland, CA); Robert Lynch (Department of Economics, Washington College); Bill Ryan, Ron Shaffer and Gary Green (Center for Community Economic Development, University of Wisconsin – Extension); Wendy Wayne (Early Education and Health Consultant Bakersfield, CA); Jason Sabo (United Way of Texas); Carla Dickerson (Coastal Enterprises Inc., Wiscasset, ME); Nicole Blumber (St. Louis Development Corporation); and Ellen Pratt (Windham Child Care Association, VT).

Copies of this report can be downloaded at http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu

For bulk copies contact childcare_econ@cornell.edu or gcobbe@smartstart-nc.org

Linking Economic Development and Child Care Research Project
Department of City and Regional Planning
Cornell Cooperative Extension
W. Sibley Hall
Cornell University
Ithaca, NY
(607) 255-670
http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu
Overview and Purpose of this Guide

Across the country as state and local teams have conducted economic analyses of the child care sector, they have faced the challenge of how to take the next step and build linkages between economic development and child care policy. The intent of this document is two-fold: 1) to educate the child care community in the core concepts of economic development, and 2) to assist the economic development community to see the connections between their work and the child care sector. To this end, the document is split into two distinct sections.

Strategy Guide
The main text of the document allows the child care community to understand the intent, process and language of economic developers and economic development planning. It describes the basic principles of economic development and the process of economic development planning. It then makes the connection between child care and economic development.

Toolbox
The second part of this report is a toolbox that goes into more detail regarding the specific tools of economic development and examples of how these tools have been applied to child care. It is designed so that readers can easily identify alternative strategies most applicable to their communities. Short descriptions are provided of specific interventions communities have tried to strengthen the child care sector using economic development strategies.

This document is one of a series of extension reports created by the Cornell Linking Economic Development and Child Care project.

Other titles include:


All are available at the Cornell website http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .................................................................................. iii
Overview and Purpose of this Guide ......................................................... iv
Table of Figures and Tables ...................................................................... vii

I. Child Care Supports Economic Development ..................................... 1
  What is Economic Development? ......................................................... 2
  Principles of Economic Development .................................................. 2
     Exports .................................................................................. 2
     Productivity ........................................................................... 3
     Sustainability .......................................................................... 4
  Understanding the Child Care Market .................................................. 4
     Private Good: Challenges of an Underdeveloped Market ................. 4
     Public Good: Market Failures ....................................................... 5

II. Economic Development Planning: How to Begin .............................. 7
  What is Economic Development Planning? ....................................... 7
  What are the Goals of Economic Development Planning? ................. 7
  Who Participates in the Process? ....................................................... 7
     Actors, Language and Governance ................................................. 8
  How Does the Process Work? .......................................................... 9
     Convenors: Build Team of Community Actors ............................... 9
     Community Values and Goals ...................................................... 10
     SWOT Analysis and Data Gathering ............................................. 11
     Strategies, Tools, Implementation, and Monitoring ......................... 11
     Economic Development Planning as a forum for change ................. 12

III. Making the Connection Between Child Care and Economic Development .......................................................... 13
  Traditional Economic Development Strategies Applied to Child Care ...... 13
  Framing Traditional Child Care Policies as Economic Development ..... 14
Economic Development Tool Box: What's Inside

Introduction ......................................................................................................................................... 19

I. Exports: Bringing in New Resources .......................................................................................... 20
   A. Promoting Exports: Tax Incentives for Business ................................................................. 20
   B. Attracting Individual Investment .......................................................................................... 22
   C. Attracting Federal Transfers .................................................................................................. 22

II. Productivity: Working Smarter ................................................................................................. 24
   A. Information, Technology and Management Strategies ......................................................... 24
      Business Retention and Expansion (BRAE) ........................................................................... 24
      Collective Management ........................................................................................................... 25
      Consumer Information: A New Role for CCR&Rs ................................................................. 26
   B. Labor Strategies ..................................................................................................................... 28
      Work/Life Policies ................................................................................................................... 28
      Professionalization in the Child Care Sector ....................................................................... 29
      Workforce Development and Child Care Subsidies ............................................................... 30
   C. Capital Strategies .................................................................................................................. 31
   D. Land & Infrastructure Strategies ........................................................................................... 32
      Transportation and Housing Funding ..................................................................................... 32
      Land Use Planning .................................................................................................................. 33
      Enterprise Zones .................................................................................................................... 34

III. Sustainability: Linking the Short and Long Term ................................................................. 35
   A. Quality of Life ....................................................................................................................... 35
   B. Human Development ............................................................................................................. 36
   C. Strategies to Build the Sustainability of the Child Care Sector ......................................... 36
      Community Coalitions ............................................................................................................ 36
      Parental Tax Credits .............................................................................................................. 37

Glossary of Terms ......................................................................................................................... 40
Bibliography .................................................................................................................................... 43

TABLE OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figures

FIGURE 1: Economic Development Principles and Strategies ....................................................... 2
FIGURE 2: The Economic Development Planning Process ............................................................. 10
FIGURE 3: Applying Traditional Economic Development Strategies to Child Care .................... 13
FIGURE 4: Framing Traditional Child Care Policies as Economic Development ...................... 14
FIGURE 5-1: Economic Development Principles—Exports ......................................................... 20
FIGURE 5-2: Projected Growth of the Service Sector ................................................................. 23
FIGURE 5-3: Economic Development Principles—Productivity ................................................. 24
FIGURE 5-4: Economic Development Principles—Sustainability ............................................. 35
FIGURE 5-5: Economic Development Principles and Strategies Linked to Child Care ............ 39

Tables

TABLE 1: Underdeveloped Markets and Economic Development Solutions .............................. 5
TABLE 2: Market Failures and Public Sector Solutions ................................................................. 6
TABLE 3: Community Actors and How to Find Them ................................................................. 8
TABLE 4: Community Actors and Their Language ........................................................................ 9

http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu
SECTION I: CHILD CARE SUPPORTS ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

The child care sector faces many market challenges to achieve quality and affordability. In the past, these issues have been addressed with a welfare approach, limiting the vital role child care plays in economic development. Across the nation, states and localities are coming together to address the role of child care as a critical social infrastructure for economic development. They are finding that child care has much to offer communities striving for economic prosperity. By reframing the issues facing the child care sector as market failures and challenges of an underdeveloped market, we can begin to find economic development solutions.

This strategy guide provides a conceptual framework for child care as economic development and offers tools for practical application. We present a collection of economic development strategies for communities working to improve access to high quality child care. We hope to make policy makers, the business community, and those working in the child care field aware of the vital role that child care plays in community economic development.

Through this guide we attempt to delineate the essential principles, strategies and tools of economic development. We also describe the market challenges of the child care sector, and give specific examples of some innovative and successful strategies used by communities and states to improve both the quality of child care and economic development.

It is our hope that through this guide a bridge will be created between these two areas, allowing for a collaboration of efforts and a new conception of both child care and economic development.

The economic importance of child care is illustrated by the trillium flower. Investment in children, their school readiness, and the productivity of our future workforce is a long term investment in human development. This is a critical component of economic development. Child care also provides more choices to working parents, enabling them to explore career ladders and be more productive at work, knowing their children are safe. At the regional level, it is time we recognized the importance of child care as an economic sector in its own right. The challenge is to move forward to improve the quality and productivity of the child care sector. This guide provides a framework for articulating how quality child care and economic development are linked.

Principles of Economic Development

The base of all economic development is investment. When private investment fails to meet a community’s particular needs, public investment or public/private partnerships may be necessary. In this document, we have organized our discussion of economic development investments around three primary principles: exports, productivity, and sustainability. These principles are based on the current realities and future challenges of economic development. Enhancement of exports has traditionally been the most popular strategy for economic development. However, the shift from a manufacturing to a service based economy and increasing global competition has emphasized the importance of productivity, especially in information technology (see Tool Box on p 14). Finally, a growing awareness of the need for human development and the scarcity of natural resources highlights the need for a sustainable approach to economic development.

We have conceptualized the process of economic development as a building, in which the foundation involves planning to invest resources. The three principles of economic development - exports, productivity and sustainability - are the pillars that form the core supports for the economic development edifice. The targets of Investment connect the pillars to the goal of economic development. Figure 1 illustrated this concept.

Exports are the most traditional form of economic development. Communities export products and services, tracking them for imports of new money from outside. The purpose of export strategies is to enhance business competitiveness in external markets and to attract external investments to the community. Some communities attempt to

SUCCESS STORIES

Matching Child Care Needs with Transit Money The Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority used $2.3 million in transportation funding to finance a child care center in the Union City Main Street transportation hub which serves over 100 children. The Center is convenient for commuting parents to drop off and pick up their children (Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority, 1996). http://www.vta.org/services/child_care.html

Earning Interest While Investing in Child Care The Self-Help Credit Union in North Carolina sells certificates of deposit (CDs) at market rates to help capitalize Self-Help’s loan fund for child care facilities. http://www.selfhelp.org/webdirectory9002/depositaccounts swallowedbyselfhelpas.asp

Economies of Scale Child Care Ventures in Santa Cruz, CA is currently planning a child care “centralized services” center. The Center would operate as an alliance of child care centers, offering services that would reduce administrative costs at individual child care centers by using an economies of scale approach. http://www.santaclara.k12.ca.us/ed/services/child_dew.html

Child Care Business Development The Development Corporation for Children in Minneapolis, MN is building a child care incubator in a six-story building with a hospital and YWCA. It will foster the creation of a number of small child care businesses. http://www.dec-corner.com

Figure 1: Economic Development Principles and Strategies

http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu
maximize government transfers as from military investment, retirees (with pensions), or attracting federal or state money for infrastructure and social welfare investments (Markusen, 1987). Another way to attract new money is by offering services that individuals might come to the community to use, such as higher education, medical care, or tourist attractions (Drewnski, 2002; Pendl, Drewnski, & Christopherson, 2004). Tax abatements are the most common economic development tool, used by more than 70% of all communities (Warner, 2001). Although the strategy of giving tax abatements to businesses has been criticized as ineffective and for creating a "race to the bottom mentality" (Barlow, 2003; Lynch, 2004) (see http://economicdevelopment.coe.umn.edu for more detail on this debate), tax credits can be applied to child care to encourage business investment and increased charitable contributions to ensure quality in the sector. States and localities can maximize their drawdown of federal funds for child care—these funds stimulate economic development directly and support workers and their employers.

**PRODUCTIVITY**

While exports remain the principal focus of economic development policy, in recent years economic developers have recognized the essential role of productivity (Porter, 1995). States and communities that prioritize productivity increase business efficiency and profitability and promote a competitive workforce and a positive business environment. According to the Economic Development Administration (EDA), productivity strategies promote the effective use of the factors of production: innovation, technology & management, labor, capital, and land.

- Information, technology and management. Universities, government and the private sector all play critical roles in research and development to create productivity-enhancing technology (National Governors' Association, 2002). Improvements in business management strategies and the creation of information networks

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES**

**COMMUNITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HAS FIVE OBJECTIVES:**

1. Stimulating a self-sustaining process of economic development.

2. Creating jobs with decent wages, benefits, and upward mobility.

3. Establishing community participation in the economic development process.

4. Stimulating entrepreneurship.

5. Enhancing the social infrastructure for economic development such as affordable housing, healthcare and quality child care (U.S. Economic Development Administration, 2000)

**SUSTAINABILITY**

Although productivity is extremely important, it cannot be the sole focus. If technological advances lead employers to hire fewer workers, business productivity can lead to job losses. (See the Tool Box for a description of the changing economic conditions in Michigan). States and communities recognize that the fundamental goal of economic development is improvement in the environment, promotion of human development, and a higher quality of life. Businesses conceptualize these goals as a triple bottom line in which business profitability is linked to environmental and community sustainability (Bowden et al., 2001). Sustainability requires an accounting of the linkages between goals that may be competing or synergistic.

- Florida, pointed to the value of quality of life investments in enhancing the creativity that is critical to economic innovation (Florida, 2000). Economists, such as Nobel Prize winner Amartya Sen, James Heckman, and Theodore Schultz, emphasize the importance of education and human capital in enhancing choice and productivity (Heckman, 1999; Schultz, 1971; Sen, 1999).

**ATTENTION TO QUALITY OF LIFE**

Attention to quality of life and human development are important not just in the short-term, but also for long-term economic development. We have identified investments in child care as part of the "social Infrastructure" that ensures our communities are prepared for business change and growth (Warner and Liu, 2004). Around the nation business coalitions are joining with child care advocates and state and local governments to develop public-private partnerships to strengthen the quality of the early care and education infrastructure (Ribeiro & Warner, 2004; Stoney, 2004c). These collaborations support innovative local programs that help the child care workforce adjust to new participants in the workforce (business and government sectors) to enhance quality and affordability.

**UNDERSTANDING THE CHILD CARE MARKET**

In order to participate in the economic development planning process, the directors and the strategy teams and others in the sector must understand the intricacies of the child care market. Child care is a special market sector like private education, in that it serves both private and public needs. Unfortunately the sector suffers from the lack of strategic intelligence and care (Hillsman & Bergmann, 2003). This central problem results both from the underdeveloped child care market and from market failures within the child care industry, limiting both the private and public benefits of child care.

**PRIVATE GOOD: CHALLENGES OF AN UNDERDEVELOPED MARKET**

As a private good, child care supports working parents. Both parents and their employers recognize the positive return on investment (ROI) from child care due to increased worker productivity. A result, work/life policies are becoming more common among private sector employers who recognize the benefits to worker productivity (see Shelldeck, 2004) for a more in-depth discussion of these policies and their ROI).

However, there are four areas where the child care market is underdeveloped. These market development challenges contribute to the lack of affordable, high quality care:

- First, there is a lack of effective demand from parents for high quality child care. High quality care is costly. Low income families can spend as much as 25-30% of their net income on child care (Hillsman & Bergmann, 2002). These costs do not include the value of parents' time. This lack of purchasing power means market signals that discourage higher quality.

- Second, there is low profitability in child care due to high labor expenses required by high staff/child ratios. Labor costs constitute the majority of expenses for a child care business; to keep costs down, firms pay low wages, resulting in a lower skilled workforce and high staff turnover.

- Third, the child care sector lacks economies of scale. The sector is largely composed of small businesses, reducing opportunities for cost reduction on the supply side and making it difficult for parents to access care from the demand side. (For a detailed discussion of collective management strategies see Stoney, 2004a)

- Finally, the sector lacks intermediaries with enough resources to provide sufficient information to parents on quality and availability of child care. For this reason, it is hard for parents to assess differences in quality.

These problems can be addressed with economic development solutions, many of them with leadership from the private sector. Table 1 provides an overview of these problems with their corresponding economic development solutions.
Table 1: Underdeveloped Markets have Economic Development Solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Underdeveloped Areas of the Child Care Market</th>
<th>Economic Development Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lack of Effective Demand</strong></td>
<td><strong>Employer Support, Tax Credits, and Subsidies</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most parents want high quality child care but are unable to afford it so their preference is not effective in influencing the supply of child care in the market place.</td>
<td><strong>World-wide pooling of on-site child care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Vouchers/Subsidies for child care from employers and the public sector</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Tax credits for businesses that support child care for their employees</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Tax credits for parents using child care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Low Profitability</strong></td>
<td><strong>Business Retention and Quality Enhancement</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low profitability leads to high turnover of child care staff</td>
<td><strong>Business retention and enhancement strategies for child care providers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited use of career ladders</td>
<td><strong>Investment capital to support start-up and expansion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of market entry for low-cost providers suppresses quality</td>
<td><strong>Wage and education incentives to promote both worker professionalization and provider retention</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lack of Economies of Scale</strong></td>
<td><strong>Networks and Collective Management</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many scattered small firms lack economies of scale and are economically fragile</td>
<td><strong>Networks and purchasing pools for information exchange and shared services</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Business management training and collective management strategies (pooled purchasing, shared recruitment and training) can enhance efficiency and increase profitability, enabling providers to focus more on direct care to children</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lack of Information</strong></td>
<td><strong>Advertising and Coordination</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard to assess quality and availability of care</td>
<td><strong>Stronger information intermediaries, advertising, and parent education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited return for investments in quality</td>
<td><strong>Child care quality rating systems</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Loans, grants, tax credits, and reimbursement; rates tied to quality to create appropriate market signals</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PUBLIC GOOD: MARKET FAILURES

As a public good, high quality early care and education prepares children for school and improves the human capital critical for a competitive economy. High quality early care and education has positive societal externality benefits which are recognized by business and economic leaders as deserving of increased public investment to ensure future economic prosperity (Cornell Institute for Economic Development, 2002; Rohrback & Grunwald, 2003). The Invest in Kids group estimates that the public finance value of a child’s child care is approximately $150,000 over their lifespan, when taking into account government assistance received relative to taxes paid (Ogunnaike, 2004; Child care is not a pure public good; as a merit good access can be restricted and this has led to underinvestment in quality care.

There are market failures inherent to the sector that lead to inadequate access to high quality child care, thereby limiting the positive externalities of child care. There are three market failures that serve as obstacles to maximizing the public good of child care:

- **First**, the sector regulates programs that are high quality. High quality depends on the child-care provider relationship, which is based primarily on high staff-child ratios. The sector does not lend itself to technical innovation, and the market stimulus for quality is limited. More typically, competition erodes quality (Faulkner, 2001).
- **Second**, unlike most market goods, child care has multiple consumers. Children are the direct consumers of care, and high quality care is in their best interest. However, parents often purchase care, and research has shown that parents often choose based on cost and convenience rather than quality (Helburn & Bergmann, 2002; Mocan, 2001; Blau & Hagy, 1998). Government and society should focus on the third consumer and seeks to maximize the positive externalities of child care for society’s best interest.
- The greatest positive returns of high quality child care are the long term effects on human development. Not only does high quality care save money in the long run through improved health and employment and reduced special education and welfare expenditures (Mazess & Barnett, 2000); high quality care and education promotes positive human development and creates a more educated society. However, these benefits take years to become apparent, while most child care expenses are borne by parents in the short term. Inadequate public investment in the sector results in underinvestment of resources to promote a high-quality system of resources.

Market failures require collective responses to promote the public good of child care. Economic development can not be sustained without investments. When market failures occur, as in the case of child care, public and private/individual partnership investments are required. See Table 2 for an overview of these market failures and public investment policies that can address each.

In addition to the promotion of human development, our society places high value on parental choice in child care arrangements. There is great diversity among early care and education providers, and in theory parents can choose among them. That is the benefit of a market-based system of early care and education. Child care businesses include both public pro K- and Head Start providers as well as private and non-profit child care centers, preschools, family child care homes, and family, friends, and neighbor caregivers (Helburn & Bergmann, 2002; Helburn & Howes, 1996). However, due to a lack of effective demand, many parents do not have real choice.

Public support is needed to address affordability and enhance parental choice and insure the quality necessary for long-term societal interests in human development and sustainable economic development.

The U.S. is a nation facing a crisis of care (Harrington, 2000). Our respect for the privacy of families and the role of markets has limited our ability to articulate a collective responsibility for care (for a detailed discussion of the challenges in the child care market see the summary of Harrington 2000 and Helburn and Bergman 2002 at http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu).

The business community has been a leader in crafting “family friendly” workplace policies. Business leadership can go a long way to help find the language and approach to build a more systemic infrastructure of child care in our nation. Economic development depends on a comprehensive systemic approach to building high-quality early education infrastructure. Public-private partnerships of business, government and community leaders are making exciting and positive improvements to child care across the nation (see the Tool Box for more details).

Table 2: Market Failures have Public Sector Solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Market Failures in Child Care</th>
<th>Public Sector Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Low Quality</strong></td>
<td><strong>Regulations and Public Support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A significant percentage of child care is of low quality</td>
<td><strong>Government subsidies to enhance quality</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quality of care is based on the relationship between child and caregiver</td>
<td><strong>Regulation of staff to skill ratios</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition can undermine quality</td>
<td><strong>Provider educational requirements</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Multiple Consumers**
- Children need high quality care
- Parents: Seek low-cost and convenient care, may not be sophisticated in quality
- Government: Interests in long-term human development and societal externalities

**Increased Availability of Knowledge and Information**
- Educating parents about quality
- Enhanced public support (as in K-12 education)
- Quality Rating Systems
- Stronger intermediaries
- Financing linked to quality
- Less categorical funding; more ability to layer funds from multiple sources

**Short-Term Focus**
- Market is focused on short-term effects
- Want to encourage long-term development for a sustainable society

**Increased Public Support**
- Increased investment in quality facilities and workforce training
- Financing linked to quality

http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu
What is Economic Development Planning?

Economic development attempts to intervene in the local economy in order to generate new employment and business opportunities for the local population. Economic development planning represents an effort on the part of the local government and community based organizations to ensure that equitable and balanced opportunities for employment occur within the community. While this process can be very political, most communities also recognize the need to engage in a thorough and pragmatic planning process. "The local economic development community recognizes the value in the people who need services and jobs and attempts to intervene to correct the market to generate new opportunities using the resources of the local population and the physical resources of the community" (Hoch, 2000:287).

Why does the market provide adequate economic development opportunities on its own, without planning? Simply because the role of the market is to foster efficiency, while local communities may desire other goals and values in addition to efficiency, such as equity and balanced growth (Griffin & Enos, 1970:22). Through the planning process actors can consciously and deliberately choose the values that matter most to their community, and use economic development strategies and tools to integrate them into economic growth.

Who Participates in the Planning Process?

Economic development planning is a process by which diverse actors in the community come together to set goals, clarify shared values, and delineate a plan by which to reach them. Economic development planning represents an effort on the part of the local government to ensure equitable and balanced opportunities for community employment and business development. Stakeholders must consciously highlight the values that matter most to their community and select appropriate economic development strategies and tools to achieve their economic development goals.

While planning strives to create equity, it also recognizes the positive attributes of the market system - enhancing efficiency and quality through competition. Local communities compete both to bring new businesses into their community and to improve quality of life for their residents. Economic development planning attempts to integrate efficiency and competitiveness with other important community values.

More than 50 localities and states throughout the U.S. have made the link between economic development and child care by conducting analyses of the regional economic importance of child care. Most of these communities have engaged in a planning process similar to the one outlined below, forming coalitions of relevant actors from the child care and business communities. See the searchable database on Cornell's webpage at: http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu to view the work of these coalitions.

What are the Goals of Economic Development Planning?

- First and foremost, economic development planning aims to create job opportunities (Levy, 2003). In communities experiencing economic growth, wages will be higher and job opportunities more plentiful (Barth, 2003; Lynch 1996, 2004).
- Second, economic development planning aims to enhance business productivity. Businesses that are more efficient and better utilize resources also contribute to economic growth (Rosenfeld, 2001).
- Third, economic development planning aims to increase the tax base. Local governments and school districts receive primary funding from local property taxes. By expanding the tax base, the local government can increase revenues without raising taxes (Barth, 2003; Levy, 2003).

Table 3: Community Actors and How to Find Them

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Private</th>
<th>Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Development Agencies</td>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFIs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local and State Government Industrial Development Agencies</td>
<td>Banks</td>
<td>Social Service Organizations, Unions, Neighborhood Associations, and Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Districts, Junior and Community Colleges</td>
<td>Private Businesses</td>
<td>Small Business Development Centers (SBDCs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Chamber of Commerce http:// <a href="http://www.uschamber.com/">www.uschamber.com/</a> chambers/chamber directory.asp</td>
<td>Service Corps of Retired Executives (SCORE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Score Association, <a href="http://www.score.org/findscore/">http://www.score.org/findscore/</a> chapter_maps.html</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Enterprise Zones (State or Federal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community Development Corporations (CDCs) / National Congress for Community Economic Development, <a href="http://www.ncced.org/">http://www.ncced.org/</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACTORS

Successful economic development planning occurs through the concerted efforts of many different local actors. These can be divided roughly into three groups: the public sector, the private sector, and the community (Hoch, 2000). There are more than 15,000 organizations in the United States devoted to economic development, most of which work at the county, city, town, and neighborhood level (Levy, 2003). Table 3 delineates these three groups, and describes how to find the local actors in your state/region.

LANGUAGE

Because the economic development planning process involves a multi-agency effort, actors will use different words to communicate their interests, as displayed in Table 4. This means that actors must become proficient in the language of their colleagues in order to move forward with common goals. Because the differences in language reflect differing values, such proficiency will help participants better understand each other's perspectives.

Goverance

The multi-agency approach involved in applying economic development strategies to child care brings with it certain challenges to governance. With diverse actors come diverse backgrounds, interests, and values. While bringing together a diversity of expertise enriches the planning process, it can also pose challenges in communication and policy implementation.
Child care specialists, economic development professionals, and government officials have different backgrounds and knowledge which inform their approaches. The degree and substance of these differences varies from community to community, but each community’s planning coalition must be aware that differences in opinions can be both a strength and a weakness.

Economic development planning coalitions must balance values of accountability and representation with the goal of effectiveness. While it is important that all voices be heard, coalitions need to be effective to maintain interest and commitment. Actors have varying interests, and the participants with the least stake in the project are the most likely to leave the table. This can lead to undue influence being given to a few key actors. In order to retain each voice, it is important to engage each stakeholder. The business community, whose members are typically very task-oriented and not interested in the lengthy details of governmental or regulatory processes, may benefit from a streamlined process as was done by the Metropolitan Council on Early Learning in Kansas (see Toolbox) with the creation of specialized committees. As all actors juggle multiple responsibilities, it is important to maintain realistic expectations concerning time commitments and progress to ensure momentum is maintained.

Table 4: Community Actors and their Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ECONOMIC DEVELOPERS</th>
<th>BUSINESS/BANKS</th>
<th>GOVERNMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job creation</td>
<td>Profits</td>
<td>Workforce Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiers</td>
<td>Return on Investments (ROI)</td>
<td>Job Creation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottom line</td>
<td>Productivity</td>
<td>Tax Base</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Life</td>
<td>Collateral</td>
<td>Tax Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Labor Force</td>
<td>Time Allocations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retention and Education</td>
<td>Market</td>
<td>Wages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Care</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of Life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retention</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Licensing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECONOMISTS</td>
<td>ECONOMISTS/PLanners</td>
<td>ECONOMISTS/PLanners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impacts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Failure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact Substitution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While public-private partnerships can be very effective, their streamlined nature presents several challenges for accountability and representation. Actors must be aware of the roles they play and the interests they represent. For example, because Child Care Resource & Referral (CCRAR) agencies are intermediaries between parents, providers, and the government, they are ideally positioned to facilitate these discussions. However, as CCRARs are expected to represent all three perspectives, they may have difficulty articulating divergent points of view. Independent representatives from each group of stakeholders might be preferable to an inclusive body. For greater discussion on issues of governance and cooperation among private-public partnerships, see the report Bringing Business to the Table (2000).

How Does the Process Work?

Economic development planning can help a community ascertain its goals and visions. It can also systematize the development process, and ensure that goals and visions are linked in practice to strategies and tools. In short, the economic development plan ensures that all the actors are on the same page.

Community economic development focuses on a decision-making process that reflects both the economic factors of markets and resources as well as a community’s social structure and decision making process (Shaffer, et. al., 2004). Several California counties, faced with development pressures and the need to increase child care facilities, have developed a Theory of Change that includes four strategies: influencing land use policy, integrating child care into economic development, supporting child care facility development and improving and enhancing the business skills of child care providers (Hildebrand and Upp, 2001). We have identified a seven step process beginning with articulation of values and goals and SWOT analysis and continuing through strategy selection, implementation and evaluation.

CONVENTIONS BUILD TEAM OF COMMUNITY ACTORS

Before the planning process can begin, a convener needs to create a team of community actors to participate in the process. Often this occurs through a series of meetings advertised by the local Economic Development Agency, to which the public is invited. Although the individual actors bring their own goals and values into the process, it must be recognized that the facilitator also begins the process with its own set of goals and values. For child care, actors are typically Child Care Resource and Referral agencies (CCRARs), Chambers of Commerce, or business leaders who recognize the need to integrate child care in the local economy. (See section two of the Cornell Methodology Guide: http://government.cce. cornell.edu/documents/MетодologyGuide.pdf)

COMMUNITY VALUES AND GOALS

Although the format will differ by community, the economic development planning process generally begins with the creation of a community or a set of goals and values important to the community. These might range from the general to the specific – and often paint a picture of the type of future the community desires. Although community goals and values are sometimes quite broad, this important first step allows all stakeholders to establish their shared values, and to become aware of their differences. Shared community values can be incorporated into the Plan’s strategies as the process progresses.

Many communities are recognizing the importance of child care in their economic development planning. Although the private role of child care may mask its public benefit as a critical social infrastructure for economic development, across the county states and localities are recognizing the value of child care (Ribeiro & Warner, 2004; Stoner, 2006c).

In California, many counties have included child care in the planning process, which has led to the creation of a planning guide linking child care and land use planning (Hildebrand & Upp, 2001) http://www.nedic.org. Tompkins County, NY, has incorporated child care into one of its three economic development strategies: Tompkins County Economic Development Strategy (Tompkins County Area Development, 1999). As a result of Vermont’s economic impact study, the state has included child care in the strategic plan linking goals for municipalities. Local planners now must incorporate child care into every plan that is created across the state (Ellen Pratt, interview March 2000). Linking local goals with a local example of how a discussion of values can lead to real action.

Tompkins County Economic Development Strategy

- Build the Economic Foundations of Tompkins County
  - Develop Human Resources — basic skills, continuing training, recruitment
  - Improve Physical Infrastructure — water and sewer, air service, scenic byways
  - Enhance Business Resources — finance, real estate, business information
  - Improve Community Infrastructure — planning, child care, housing, arts

- Create Employment and Business Opportunities
  - Foster Expanding and Historic Businesses with a focus on exporting industries
  - Target Activities to Key Sectors — Education, Manufacturing, High Tech, Agriculture, Tourism, Finance

- Reflect Community Values in the Economic Development Process
  - Create Opportunity for All — income groups, personal abilities, and with different needs
  - Work Together — inter-municipal cooperation, business-government-community partnerships
  - Build on Assets — highly educated workforce, entrepreneurial climate, academic institutions, quality of life
  - Work Smart — inform, evaluate, and target programs to optimize economic development investments

SWOT Analysis and Data Gathering

After the community goals and values have been delineated, the participants analyze the community's economy. In order to understand its potential and its weaknesses, as well as its resources. This is often called SWOT analysis (assessment of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats). The assessment process is supported through 1) data gathering and analysis, 2) an assessment of the community's future, both in terms of expected population and business needs and 3) a planning process.

The child care impact study reports prepared by most states are an important contribution to SWOT analysis. The Massachusetts child care impact study discusses labor force needs, with theconcatenate need to expand both child care and the workforce. The New York child care impact study shows that the highest job growth has been in areas - such as the retail and service sectors - in which employees have the greatest need for child care support. (Warner et al. 2004). A four state study (Olsanera & Weber, 2001) has found that the majority of subsidy recipients work in retail and service sectors. Florida's kind of labor market analysis to encourage private employers to match federal dollars to expand subsidies to eligible workers (Stone, Mitchel, & DiCorcia, 2001).

Strategies, Implementation, and Evaluation

Based on the vision, goals, and SWOT analysis, participants next begin to identify appropriate objectives, along with strategies and tools, which can aid in creating the community's desired future. At this point an implementation strategy is also developed, along with a strategy for monitoring the progress of the community's plan as it is carried out (Kelly & Becker, 2000).

Economic Development Planning as a Forum for Change

As is evident from the above description of the planning process, the creation of an economic development plan presents an opportunity for local actors to incorporate common goals, such as child care, into a process of growth. In short, child care can be:

- A community goal, as we value the development of human capital and social infrastructure within our communities, as well as support for families.
- A contribution to the analysis of a community: what role does child care play, and how important is it to workforce, business and quality of life in our changing communities?
- An important strategy and tool in the economic development process.

Child care can contribute to the community planning process at each stage in the plan creation. By making child care an integral part of economic development, communities will benefit. The Kansas study pinpointed the creation of a Knowledge Economy, based on information and high technology, as a core strategy for economic growth. A key component of this strategy is the role of child care in early childhood education. The private and public sectors are increasingly recognizing their shared interest in promoting social infrastructure, including child care, as a means to economic development (Ribando & Warner, 2004). Furthermore, by viewing child care within an economic development framework, its market challenges can be addressed with economic development solutions. More detail on how state and local teams have approached policy planning can be found in qualitative evaluation reports (Scione 2004) and in case study profiles on Cornell's web site: http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu.
As child care has traditionally been viewed from a welfare or education perspective, understanding child care as economic development can be difficult to conceptualize both for the child care community and economic development leaders. To facilitate this process, we provide examples of how child care policies can be viewed as economic development, and how economic development strategies can be applied to the child care sector.

**Traditional Economic Development Strategies Applied to Child Care**

In Figure 3, the connection between economic development and child care is shown by linking the economic development principles of exports, productivity and sustainability to strategies that could be used by the child care sector. For example, productivity can be enhanced by improving information exchange and management through Business Retention and Expansion Services (BR & E). In Philadelphia, with funding from the United Way and the William Penn Foundation, the TRF Reinvestment Fund (http://www.irlfund.com) provides intensive technical assistance on fiscal management issues to thirty child care centers. By focusing on issues such as budget preparation and negotiation, and cash flow management, BR & E programs can improve the productivity and sustainability of the child care sector (Stony, 2004).

Labor productivity can be enhanced through work-place policies. Employers have recognized that work-life policies, especially providing reliable child care for their workers, reduces absenteeism and worker turnover, and increases worker productivity (Shalkerdak, 2004). CoOpA Corps purchased child care slots in community day care centers to expand the supply of weekend and evening care to support its second shift workers (Stony et al., 2001). With this guarantee that their slots would be filled, more providers were willing to remain open for longer hours.

Economic development is also achieved through investment in the physical infrastructure of communities—especially housing and transportation. Several communities have adopted innovative ways to link child care with housing and transportation funds. Locating child care in or near to housing developments reduces the number of daily trips parents must make, which makes the neighborhood more attractive to families, while reducing car use. For example, the San Francisco Housing Authority channeled HUD V related funds to include a child care facility in Bernal Housing Development (San Francisco Housing Authority, 2003). Transportation dollars are another source of potential funding for child care facilities. By integrating child care with transportation needs, communities can make child care more accessible, reduce commuting time for parents, alleviate congestion and pollution, and encourage the use of public transportation. By aligning child care needs with housing and transportation needs, communities can tap an alternate stream of federal and state funds while enhancing productivity and sustainability. The Tamien Child Care Center, built in 1995 at a transportation hub in Santa Clara County, California, was designed to address all these goals and concerns (Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority, 2004).

**Figure 4: Framing Traditional Child Care Policies as Economic Development**

Most child care policy comes from an education or welfare perspective, but these tools can be viewed from an economic development perspective as well. See Figure 4. For example, child care subsidies have traditionally been viewed and justified as a form of welfare. However, subsidies also can be understood as an example of economic development in the form of Exports and Productivity. Since welfare reform, government subsidies for low-income working parents have increased over 250% (Mezey, Greenberg, & Schumacher, 2002). Subsidies are portable funding for low-income parents and bring new federal and state funds into local communities. This import of money can be maximized by expanding eligibility ceilings as was done in Rhode Island, or using the business community to help advertise subsidies to eligible working parents (Tompkins County Early Education Partnership). The provision of child care subsidies also increases productivity by supporting labor mobilization (Hoffert & Collins, 2000; Wicz & Quaretz, 2003).

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PRINCIPLES**

- Exports
- Productivity
- Sustainability

**TARGETS OF INVESTMENT**

- Attracting External Investment (Federal Funds)
- Capital (Enhancing Consumer Demand)
- Technology & Information Management (Facilitating Industry and Consumer Networks)
- Labor Professionalization and Workforce Development
- Social Infrastructure and Quality of Life (Improving Education Outcomes)
- Human Development (Ensuring quality of education)

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES**

- Proven Business Competitiveness
- Attracting New Investment Streams and Promoting Competitiveness
- Information, Technology & Management
- Employee-Based/Work/Life Policies
- Land and Infrastructure Productivity
- Social Infrastructure and Quality of Life
- Human Development

**Figure 3: Applying Traditional Economic Development Strategies to Child Care**

**Figure 4: Framing Traditional Child Care Policies as Economic Development**
Many states recognize the problems of low wages and high turnover of employees in the child care sector. The T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood Project is a public-private collaborative in 23 states that provides educational scholarships for teachers, directors, and family child care providers. T.E.A.C.H. increases professionalism and quality within the child care sector and has implications for economic development. T.E.A.C.H. applies workforce development strategies to the child care labor force by focusing on increasing workforce retention and improving worker skills. Enhancing quality of child care providers will further the goals of human development and quality of life, which promote long-term sustainability. The Cost, Quality and Outcomes Study found that better wages are correlated with better care (Frank Porter Graham Child Development Center, 1999).

States use licensing regulations as a consumer protection measure and, in some cases, to improve the quality of care through higher staff/child ratios and higher training requirements for providers. An increasing number of states are augmenting regulatory requirements with a new Quality Rating System that encourages providers to meet standards that exceed minimum licensing. However, simply raising licensing and regulation requirements or establishing a Quality Rating System without giving attention to cost and price constraints faced by child care providers and parents can have the adverse effect of driving child care providers and parents out of the formal child care system. When public or private financing is linked to quality, it can create market signals that promote higher quality care, thereby enhancing sustainability and the development of human capital critical to economic development (Scarrow, 2004b).

These are just a few of the many ways the child care sector can be strengthened through economic development approaches. A more detailed description of the basic principles of economic development policy and strategies which could be applied to child care is provided in the Tool Box, which also describes the challenges of economic development in the context of a jobless recovery. The language and tools of economic development are new to the child care community, and child care is a new target for economic development policy. This guide is designed to facilitate dialogue between these two policy areas. Both our children and our local economies stand to benefit from such a collaboration.
INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................. 19

I. EXPORTS: BRINGING IN NEW RESOURCES .................................................................................. 20

Exports bring in new money from outside the community to promote economic growth. Communities typically
use tax credits to attract or retain industry. Tax credits can be applied to child care to promote private sector
investment. State and local investments also can leverage Federal funding.

A. Promoting Exports: Tax Incentives for Business ...................................................................... 20
B. Attracting Individual Investment ................................................................................................. 22
C. Attracting Federal Transfers ....................................................................................................... 22

II. PRODUCTIVITY: WORKING SMARTER ...................................................................................... 24

A. Information, Technology and Management Strategies ................................................................. 24

We can better use the resources we have by employing strategies that enhance productivity.
Information and management can be improved through business retention and expansion. Programs that
encourage child care businesses to work together can improve performance and reduce costs. Rating
systems for early childhood education and improved consumer information help make quality marketable.

Business Retention and Expansion Services (BR&E) ...................................................................... 24
Collective Management .................................................................................................................. 25
Consumer Information: A New Role for CCR&Rs ........................................................................ 26

B. Labor Strategies ............................................................................................................................ 28

Development of human capital in all sectors, including child care, contributes to economic development.
Work-life policies that include child care provisions reduce turnover and absenteeism, making businesses
more competitive. The professionalization of the child care sector raises the wages that employees spend
in the community, and contributes to the quality of care. Subsidies for child care expand the available
parent workforce for local business needs.

Work-Life Policies .............................................................................................................................. 28
Professionalization in the Child Care Sector .................................................................................... 29
Workforce Development and Child Care Subsidies ......................................................................... 30

C. Capital Strategies .......................................................................................................................... 31

Financing sources for child care include banks, community development funds, and bonds. The Community
Reinvestment Act provides leverage to promote private banks’ interest in lending to the child care sector.
Some funding strategies, such as the loan program of Self-Help in North Carolina, reward quality.

III. SUSTAINABILITY: LINKING THE SHORT AND LONG-TERM .................................................... 35

Quality child care improves quality of life for working parents, builds human capital, and creates a favorable
environment for businesses to grow and to attract and keep employees. Community coalitions that include
business leadership can build local partnerships to create a more comprehensive early education system and
help working parents afford quality care.

A. Quality of Life ................................................................................................................................. 35
B. Human Development ...................................................................................................................... 36
C. Strategies to Build the Sustainability of the Child Care Sector .................................................... 36

Community Coalitions .................................................................................................................... 36
Parental Tax Credits ......................................................................................................................... 37

Glossary of Terms ............................................................................................................................... 40
Bibliography ........................................................................................................................................ 43

http://economicdevelopment.cce.cornell.edu
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT TOOL BOX

"Today, most Americans... say that raising children is the responsibility of parents with support of others in the community. More people now actually believe the ancient African proverb that 'it takes a village to raise a child.'"


The tools of economic development can help child care planners get the support they need from their constituent communities at the local, state and federal levels. Quality child care benefits more than parents and children; it supports the local economy as well, making child care a good investment in the future of the community. Using economic development tools effectively, however, means making some changes in how we think about and talk about child care.

When many of us think of industry, we think of factories with smokestacks and assembly lines. An industry can be any community of practitioners that provides a particular type of goods and services to a larger community that wants them. In this larger sense, child care is an industry just as health care is an industry, contributing to the economy as employees spend their paychecks, and providing buy or rent property and purchase goods and services in the local community. Economic development professionals understand the importance of providing quality systemic child care when the need for it is expressed in the language they are used to hearing.

One of the advantages of using the language of business is that it gives those in the business and economic development communities a vocabulary and conceptual framework for the support of child care that is consistent with their worldview. In this toolbox we describe in more detail the principles and strategies of economic development, typical economic development applications, and some caveats about economic development policy. We also provide examples of how these strategies can be applied to child care.

Exports (whether to the surrounding region, nation or international markets) generate new revenue and wealth in a community. States and communities can increase revenue from exports by focusing on those industries in which they have a competitive advantage (agricultural, manufacturing, or service sectors), attracting individuals who purchase local services, and maximizing federal and state funds. Communities have traditionally placed emphasis on attracting, retaining, and expanding export-oriented businesses through the use of tax incentives. More recently, attention is being given to the importance of service sector businesses, such as producer services (finance, insurance and real estate), or attracting individuals from outside the community to purchase local services, such as education, tourism, and health care (Drennan, 2002). Finally, local governments can bring in new revenue through maximizing federal and state funds for a variety of economic development and social programs. For example, military funding and transfer payments to individuals are credited with much of the suburban economic boom of the 1970s and 1980s (Marxuson, 1987).

A. Promoting Exports: Tax-Incentives for Business

State and local governments seek to maximize the benefits of exporting sectors by offering tax incentives for businesses under the assumption that communities will benefit from jobs and income generated by export businesses. Jobs supported by exports tend to pay 13 to 18 percent higher than the national average (U.S. Trade Representations, 2000). Tax incentives are the most popular strategy used by state and local governments for attracting businesses — they aim to reduce the cost of operations to allow businesses to remain competitive in the domestic and global economies. Tax incentives commonly appear in five forms: credits, abatements/reductions, deferrals, exemptions, and refunds (Poole, 1999).

Tax incentives are typically used for manufacturing firms, the industry most likely to export. However, they are also used for other large businesses, such as retail. A 1998 survey by the American Economic Development Council found that 40 percent of state business incentive programs revolve around tax incentives (American Economic Development Council, 1998). A recent International City/County Management Association survey indicates that 70 percent of local governments use tax-incentives to recruit businesses into their communities (Warner, 2001). States and local communities are typically under the impression that tax-incentives may lower the cost of business, and promote job creation (Burkat, 2003). States with lower taxes have historically been seen as having a positive business climate and now most states feel compelled to offer tax-incentives to remain competitive (Lynch, 1996, 2004).

Receiving a tax credit means that the business pays a reduced tax rate or local property tax is waived for some period of time. Tax-incentives granted by local government tend to be free business from property taxes, and those granted by state government tend to offset corporate income tax. The United States collectively allocated $4.6 billion in lost state tax revenues for tax-incentive programs (Poole, 1999).

Figure T-1 Economic Development Principles - Exports
**Employing the Credibility of Economic Development Claims**

The economic development strategies described in this document appear to be based on a combination of historical data and current economic trends. The emphasis on attracting businesses and fostering economic growth is consistent with the goals of many states and local governments. However, the success of these strategies may depend on a variety of factors, including the local business environment, available resources, and the overall economic climate.

One of the key elements in these strategies is the provision of tax incentives. These incentives are designed to encourage businesses to locate or expand in the area. The document mentions several types of tax incentives, such as enterprise zones, tax abatements, and tax credits. While these incentives can be beneficial in the short term, they may also have long-term costs if they divert resources from other essential services.

Another important aspect of these strategies is the promotion of workforce development and job training. The document highlights the need for a skilled workforce to support the growth of the local economy. This is particularly relevant in the current economic climate, where skills and qualifications are becoming increasingly important.

Overall, the strategies outlined in this document appear to be well-intentioned and designed to support economic growth. However, it is important to consider the long-term impacts of these strategies and ensure that they align with the broader goals of the community.
Services in Context: The Decline of the Manufacturing Sector

To understand economic development policy, you must first understand the changing economic context of the United States. Historically, exports have been most likely to come from the manufacturing sector, which was the largest industry in the U.S. economy in the 1970s and 1980s (U.S. Congressional Budget Office, 2004). Thus, state and local governments often targeted manufacturing businesses with tax incentives. However, in recent years, trends in the U.S. economy indicate a declining role for manufacturing. The manufacturing sector has experienced substantial job losses over the past 30 years due to technological innovation, cyclical recessions, and global outsourcing.

In the past two decades, the decline of manufacturing has been offset by growth in the service sector, which expanded by 46 percent from 1980-1992 (Katticher, 1993, November), particularly in the areas of education, health, and business services (Bernstein, 2003; U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2003). Even so, employment growth in the 1980s—"the quality of American jobs is measured by wages, benefits, and job security deteriorated. The decline of jobs in the high-paying manufacturing sector, growth of jobs in the low-paying service sector; the growth of part-time and temporary employment, and the general decline in real wages among less-educated, less-skilled workers have been presented as evidence of an erosion of job quality" (Hausman, 1995).

While productivity in the manufacturing sector and certain service sectors, such as Information Technology, is increased through technological innovation and may result in job loss over time; in human services, such as child care, increased demand is primarily met through an expanded workforce. At present, the service sector accounts for 50 percent of domestic output and creates many low-skill, low-wage, and no-benefit jobs (Labor Research Association, 1999). According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics, half of the occupations that will create the largest number of new jobs between 1998 and 2008 are retail salespersons, cashiers, truck drivers, office clerks, and personal care household aids (U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1997). While job growth in certain service industries, such as education, healthcare, and tourism, puts money in the economy, the type of employment they produce creates concerns about job quality.

Nearly 40 percent of all low-wage paying businesses are in the service sector, while less than 4 percent of low-wage businesses are in the manufacturing sector. It is important to note, however, that 42 percent of medium wage businesses, and 25 percent of high-wage businesses are also in the service industry. This suggests that service jobs have the potential to generate high wages and a high standard of living within a community (Anderson, Hogrefe, & Lane, 2003). However, studies have found the majority of low-wage workers who receive child care subsidies are concentrated in the retail and service sector (Osiyama & Weber, 2001). Wages are associated with worker turnover—75 percent of low-wage firms experience at least 100 percent turnover annually, compared to 33 percent turnover in high-wage firms. Smaller firms in the retail and service industries tend to pay lower wages than larger employers, when the quality of the labor pool is held constant (Anderson et al, 2003). The plentiful low-wage jobs with high turnover in the child care sector exemplify this dilemma.

A. Information Technology and Management Strategies

Economic development requires new technology, improved information networks, and management strategies to foster the innovation necessary for productivity. In our modern economy, standard products can be manufactured in other countries at a lower cost. Thus, it is critical that states and localities invest in innovation and effective management strategies that will help them compete in a global market.

Business Retention and Expansion Services (BR & E) are an excellent way the public sector can facilitate information exchange and management training and support. "Getting information on the needs of local businesses and then encouraging government actions to better meet those needs and increase local benefits" is a goal of BR & E programming (Barcl, 2003). Improvements in information exchange and management strategies lead to the sharing of innovative ideas between organizations within the same industrial sector and enhance efficiency (Rosenfeld, 2001; Tracey & Clark, 2003). Business clusters and industrial districts represent a category of such management strategies. A business cluster is an alliance between individual organizations within the same industry. Businesses in these alliances benefit from economies of scale by sharing the same infrastructure, customers, technologies, or skills base. Individual businesses within clusters carve out a specific phase of production or a particular geographic area to focus upon, rather than competing with other firms. These strategies enhance productivity by decreasing transaction costs and encouraging innovation as businesses are pressured by their partners to remain on the "cutting edge" (Porter, 1995). The rationale for this is that Porter: "Clusters: The Ying and Yang of Rural Development". http://www.rssinc.org/publications/KCFed.pdf A debate on Porter's productivity strategies is found in Warner and Liu 2004 and on our website.

SECTION II
PRODUCTIVITY: WORKING SMARTER

Attracting export income is only a small portion of an economic strategy. Economic development is primarily about improving productivity—promoting the most effective use of the factors of production: land, labor, capital, and technology and management. Increased productivity generates local wealth. When businesses are able to keep production costs down, while increasing their outputs of goods and services, this productivity improvement, and the consequent increase in profits, helps the community as local wages rise and jobs are created.

Typically, economists delineate four types of resources that can be used to promote economic productivity: 1) information, technology, and management; 2) labor; 3) capital; and 4) land or infrastructure.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PRINCIPLES

WHAT CAN COMMUNITIES DO?

STRAATEGIES FOR ACTION

- Enhancing existing businesses (Clusters, Business Retention, Development, and Expansion)
- Job creation, Workforce development, Educator/Work/life
- On-site child care, subsidies, work/life policies, child care workforce supports and training
- Low-interest loans, start-up grants, tiered reimbursement
- Multi-use facilities, facilities financing, flexible transportation and housing funds for child care, land use and zoning regulation

Figure T-3
Economic Development Principles - Productivity
Because the child care sector cannot substitute capital for labor (because quality depends on high staff/child ratios), RAD strategies are largely inapplicable and such funding sources typically are not targeted to child care. However, many actors in the child care sector would benefit from improved management strategies and strengthened industry information networks. Most states use child care quality funding for business management training. However, economic development agencies such as CDCs or SBDCs can provide management and financial support for these same services.

With funding from the United Way and the William Penn Foundation, the Reinvestment Fund provides intensive technical assistance on fiscal management issues to thirty child care centers in Philadelphia. The Trust has worked individually with local centers on a range of fiscal management issues including budget preparation and reconciliation, cash flow management, staffing, and many others.http://www.rfn.org/

Child Care Ventures in Santa Cruz, CA received a grant from their local community foundation to plan a child care "centralized services" center. The Center would operate as an alliance of child care centers, offering services that would reduce administrative costs at individual child care centers by using an economies of scale approach. http://www.santascruz.ca.us/ed_services/child_care.html

Long Island used funding from the New York Small Business Development Centers to create a CD-rom that provides business management planning software for child care businesses. http://www.nyslodic.org/

Coastal Enterprises, in Maine, teaches child care providers about federal and state sources of funding, provides technical assistance to providers developing funding proposals, and teaches business management techniques. The project also issues loans to support the education and training of providers. http://www.nccic.org/cdapartnerships/profiles/coel.htm

Collective Management

Provider networks and clusters can increase communication and idea exchange. Most providers are small enterprises, usually with small numbers of staff, and lack internal economies of scale. Through networks, child care providers can benefit from external economies of scale, allowing for shared services and the bulk purchasing of supplies and insurance. Child Care Resource & Referral (CCR&R) agencies, Community Development Financial Institutions, Chambers of Commerce, and others can assist providers to organize networks. The business community can help child care establishments identify new management strategies that maintain quality of service and reduce overhead costs.

With less than 25% of child care expenses occurring in administrative functions the benefits of collective management are limited. Yet, there is still potential for economies of scale in administration, staffing, and purchasing. Some examples are outlined below. For more information, see Louis Stone's 2004 report on Collective Management at: http://government.cce.comell.edu/doc/pdfs/CollectiveManagement.pdf.

Community Day Care, Inc./Community Day Charter School (Lawrence, MA) is a non-profit corporation that serves approximately 900 children each day in 7 center-based sites and a network of family child care homes. An additional 300 children are served in a charter school which is located at 3 sites — an upper school for grades 5-8, a lower school for grades K-4, and a new early learning center for 4 year olds. The child care centers, family child care network and charter school share the same administration, including the following services: fiscal (billing, fee collection, payroll) human resources, staff development, support services (nurses, therapists, bi-lingual/bi-cultural issues, etc.), food services (CACFP program management & purchasing), data analysis, technical support, maintenance and transportation. (Stone, 2004).

The Children's Home (Chattanooga, TN) is a non-profit agency that directly operates a child development center for 350 children and also provides management services to 4 additional community-based early childhood programs that collectively serve approximately 200 additional children, 6 weeks through 5 years of age. Each contract site has its own non-profit status, board of directors and a separate banking account. However, the board of each participating center hires the Children's Home to provide all management/support services, and management staff is shared. The sites all have the same wage scale, benefits, employment policies, and curriculum. All fiscal and administrative services are coordinated, using the same automated systems and reports. The CEO of the Children's Home reports to the boards of each contract agency and attends their monthly board meetings. The President of the board of each contract agency is an "ex officio" member of the Children's Home board (Stone, 2004).

Infant Toddler Family Day Care, Inc. (Fairfax, Virginia) is an independent, non-profit early care and education network of home-based child care providers serving approximately 340 children six weeks and up. Providers under this umbrella receive a wide range of support and services including: marketing, training (start-up and on-going), monthly support visits, billing and collection of child care fees, paid vacation, liability insurance, field trips, group activities, a professional network, emergency consultation and technical assistance. Parents also have access to support groups, parenting education (there is a special group for dads and toddlers) and stable care (infant care is available if a provider is ill) (Stone, 2004a).

Centers that Care is a project of a non-profit CCR&R agency, Action for Children in Columbus, Ohio. Centers that Care staff recruit and screen individuals interested in employment in early care and education programs. The goal is to give center directors a place to go to for a pool of eligible applicants, rather than spending so much of their own time recruiting and screening staff. Centers that Care recruits a broad pool of qualified applicants (including on-site recruiting at college campuses), screens each applicant according to Ohio licensing standards (including background and reference checks), creates an assessment profile on each applicant, maintains a website, accessible by password for member centers, that includes a pool of screened applicants ready for employment. (Stone, 2004a).

PEO for Child Care Employees —The Association of Early Childhood Professionals in Greensboro, NC has proposed the development of a Private Employment Organization (PEO) to obtain group cost-effective health insurance for providers through collective purchase. A PEO becomes the "Employer of Record" and allows small firms, such as child care providers to benefit from group purchasing. Additional information on PEOs is available at http://www.napeo.org. The Greensboro proposal will explore the possibility of extending the Keystone Research Center's PEO model to child care.

Consumer Information

One requirement for a healthy market is access to information for both buyers and sellers. The child care sector lacks product differentiation, and needs information intermediaries to help consumers evaluate the quality of various child care options. Some states have funded child care intermediaries and/or implemented quality rating systems to help address this information deficit.

Child Care Resource and Referral Agencies (CCR&R) provide an intermediary infrastructure for child care purchasers and consumers by assessing the community's need, providing referral services, and developing supply (http://www.nccic.org/ccpartnerships/profiles/cc2000th.htm).
B. Labor Strategies

Beginning with Nobel Prize-winning economist Theodore Schultz, economists have recognized the critical importance of human capital to economic productivity (Schultz, 1971). When individuals forgo immediate earnings to invest in education and training, they improve their future earning power by investing in their own human capital.

A commitment to a strong education system at all levels is a commitment to human capital and economic productivity. The American business community has long embraced this truth, demonstrated most recently by their dedication to universal pre-kindergarten education (Committee for Economic Development, 2002). In addition to investing in a strong K-12 system, governments encourage human capital investment through such public university critical and scholarships, grants and low-interest loans for students pursuing higher education opportunities. Higher education fosters the advanced knowledge and specialized skills that lead to the innovation that drives productivity (National Governor’s Association, 2003). The child care sector lends itself to labor strategies in three areas. To promote labor productivity in general, employers recognize the need to invest in child care through work/life policies for their employees. Within the child care sector itself, professionalism can reduce turnover and promote quality. Finally, for lower-income working families and their employers, child care subsidies are a very important component of workforce development policy.

Work/Life Policies

In recent years, employers have given increased attention to promoting work/life balance, by crafting workplace policies which help workers balance their professional obligations with their personal responsibilities and aspirations. Most Fortune 500 companies address issues such as flexible hours, job-sharing, and accessibility to child care for good reason; studies have shown that family supportive companies consistently surpass the performance of the Standard & Poor 500 companies over the past three years. (For a more complete discussion of work/life policies see Shellenbarger (2001). Research has connected family friendly policies to increased employee satisfaction, customer satisfaction, and increased profits, supporting the case for work/life policies (Ruef, Kim, & Quinlan, 1998). These private sector trends highlight the growing importance of child care to economic productivity (Families and Work Institute, 1999). When parents have access to high-quality, reliable child care, they can be expected to be more productive in the workplace, because less time is devoted to personal issues and their employers benefit from reduced turnover and absenteeism.

Most businesses employ parents who need child care to work. While large companies may have the resources to build an on-site child care facility to support their employees, this is not a realistic option for most employers. It may be possible for several small businesses to pool together their resources to create more community child care. Federal tax policy establishes flexible spending accounts (FSAs) for child care, such as the Dependent Care Assistance Plan (DCAP), in which employers deposit a percentage of pre-tax wages into an account with money that will be available for child care.

On-Site Child Care

Some employers have established on-site child care centers or contracts with a non-profit or proprietary child care company to provide child care for their employees. By providing high quality, reliable child care, employers can reduce employee absenteeism, retention, and productivity. Bright Horizons, a national child care company that specializes in employer-sponsored child care, offers a Return on Investment (ROI) calculator on their website at www.brighthorizons.com/calc/ to help employers assess the benefits of investing in child care.

Employee Contracts with Child Care Centers

ConAgra Refrigerated Foods reached out to local Head Start and child care programs to help create a child care initiative for workers who earned hourly wages. These public/private partnerships made it possible to expand public Head Start and child care programs to meet the needs of low-wage employees who do shift work and live in rural areas where regulated child care is scarce (Mitchell, Stone, & Dichter, 1997).

Additional Resources on State Labor Policies

Comparison of Current Publicly Funded State Initiatives for Compensation & Retention
Provides a table of state initiatives for compensation and retention of the early care and education workforce listed by program, including North Carolina’s W.A.G.E.S Program and Washington’s Pilot ECE Career Ladder: http://www.nccic.org/plus/comparison.pdf

Early Care and Education Career Development Initiatives
Provides a table of initiatives for professional development of the early care and education workforce listed by state: http://www.nccic.org/plus/stateplan/stateplan-intro.html
Flexible Spending Accounts (FSA)

Employers can create benefits accounts for individual employees, where each employee determines how much of his or her income is deposited in the account per year for child care expenses. Employers reduce costs because the money in FSAs is exempt from payroll taxes and the cost of implementing the FSA plan is tax deductible. The funds are exempt from Medicare, Social Security, and Federal and State Income taxes, saving between $1000 and $2500 per employee per year; see http://government.cce.cornell.edu/locppdf/ FSA%20Employee%20Info.pdf.

Employer-Sponsored Child Care

Many employers make direct contributions to employee FSA accounts. Since 2002 Cornell University's Child Care Grant Subsidy Program provides financial support for their employees' child care expenses. Grants are awarded based on each family's total child care costs as a percentage of income. The program is run through Cornell's Flexible Spending Account (FSA), making the funds tax-free. See http://www.aoc.cornell.edu/ benefits/childcaregrant/CCG05AC2005.pdf.

Professionalization in the Child Care Sector

The child care workforce needs professionalization. Low returns lead to low staff wages, and high turnover frustrates attempts to raise the level of educational attainment. Furthermore, there is still a limited career ladder, particularly in home-based care, although child care professionals are working to change this (Holbue & Bergman, 2002; Holbue & Howe, 1996). There are many programs that focus on improving the qualifications and compensation of child care workers, including T.E.A.C.H. AND WAGES. Financing scholarships and increased wages for child care staff can be considered part of an economic development strategy.

Creating Links between Training and Compensation

T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood® Project is a public-private partnership that provides educational scholarships for teachers, directors, and family child care providers serving young children. As a result, the program has increased the workforce retention and improved the capacity of providers to deliver high quality care. Currently in 23 states, the program is funded through collaboration with the federal Child Care and Development Fund, corporate and foundation grants (Stoney et al., 2001).

Workforce Development and Child Care Subsidies

Workforce development helps mobilize the labor force, by identifying the needs of employers and providing workers with the training necessary to fill those needs. Public-private partnerships are longstanding in the workforce development arena. The Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA), enacted in 1982, to place low-income individuals in private sector employment, focused on developing the skills that local employers demanded in job applicants. The JTPA increased the business community's participation by establishing Private Industry Councils (PICs) (Eberts & Erickson, 2002).

In 1998, the JTPA was replaced by the Workforce Investment Act (WIA), which calls for the establishment of both state and local Workforce Development Boards. These community coalitions are comprised of local business people and civic leaders, but business people comprise the majority of board members. The WIA also requires local workforce development boards to establish temporary job service centers available to all job seekers regardless of income or employment status.

These services include a preliminary assessment of the job seeker's skills and support service needs, the provision of information concerning employment-related services, training opportunities and labor-market information; assistance with unemployment insurance claims; job search, placement assistance and career counseling. The boards contract with various nonprofit and government agencies to provide these services (Eberts & Erickson, 2002). For example, in Texas, the Workforce Development Boards allocate child care subsidies. With proper collaboration a strong coalition could devise creative uses of child care funds to address both child care quality and workforce needs.

Publicly funded child care also plays a key role in supporting business. In order to stay competitive and keep their large overhead costs low many employers, especially small businesses, do not pay wages that are high enough to cover the cost of purchasing child care. Thus, when government makes child care subsidies available to low-income working families, it is actually helping many small businesses recruit and retain employees (Stoney et al., 2001). Indeed, as a result of increased workforce participation and the growth in low-paying jobs, the public provision of child care subsidies has helped millions of parents to obtain and maintain employment. In 2001, $5.2 billion in federal and state child care funds were made available to low-income families (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children & Families, 2004). Research shows that most parents who receive public child care subsidies work in the service and retail sectors which are the most rapidly growing employment sectors in the U.S. economy (Okazawa & Weber, 2001).
C. Capital Strategies

Typically, entrepreneurs and businesses look to banks and venture capital firms for financing. Firms need both operating capital for business expenses and investment capital for new equipment and facilities. Venture capital is also an important source of equity for start-up companies. (National Venture Capital Association, 2004).

Unfortunately, if we rely solely on these traditional sources of financing, many potential business owners will not have access to capital they need, particularly in underserved communities. The Community Reinvestment Act responds to this dilemma by requiring financial institutions to reinvest in the communities where their deposits originate. Under this Act, not only are banks helping to meet the credit needs of the communities they operate in, but the financial interests of the banks become more deeply intertwined with the development goals of the community. CRA funds can be targeted towards child care.

To address underserved populations, community and government agencies have developed programs to create a more balanced distribution of capital. Community agencies include: Community Development Corporations (CDCs) and Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFIs). Government agencies include the United States Small Business Administration (SBA) and the SBA administered Small Business Development Centers (SBDCs). These agencies provide loans, grants, and other forms of business support to qualifying small firms, including microloans and revolving loan funds.

Child care businesses often have difficulty securing loans from conventional lending institutions to cover business needs (Heidbreder & Bergmann, 2002). Many states offer qualifying child-care providers grants to cover start-up expenses around health and safety, but the sums are inadequate to capitalize all start-up needs.

Facility finance strategies: Banks, bond financing, and community development funds can be used to support child care facility development.

The Community Investment Collaborative for Kids (CICK), affiliated with the Local Initiatives Support Corporation, combines technical expertise in real estate development and finance with knowledge of the child care sector to devise innovative strategies for funding and building child care centers. CICK attempts to bring all parties to the table—public officials, providers, members of the business community, and others—in order to accomplish this goal. Projects vary across the nation. In Connecticut, CICK played an instrumental role in designing legislation that would provide bond financing for facilities in the state's most distressed communities. http://www.lisc.org/resources/asset/asset_upload/file/66_160.pdf

The Ohio Community Development Finance Fund (CDFF) has used innovative strategies to improve child care providers' access to facility financing. This involves depositing funds into a conventional lending institution for the purpose of refinancing the bank's loan to fund child care and Head Start programs for short-term construction projects at a lower cost. http://www.oicff.org/publicfinancing-cic/oicf0601.html

The Development Corporation for Children, based in Minneapolis, MN, provides financing for early childhood education through First Children's Finance. The Corporation is building a hospital campus that will serve as an incubator for child care businesses, which will generate, development assistance, and training with the goal of making them sufficiently stable to move into their own spaces elsewhere. The incubator will have bungalows for multicultural child care centers of the family type that will serve as a hub for training and resources. The bungalows are expected to house mainly New Americans (Somalis, Hmong, Tibetan, etc.) in culturally-specific contexts. Funding is already available and construction will begin soon. www.DCCcorner.com

Using the Community Reinvestment Act for Child Care: The Community Reinvestment Act provides leverage to promote private banks' interest in lending to the child care sector.

Like all financial institutions, Providian Financial is required under the Community Reinvestment Act to make loans within the banking area that assist families in obtaining homes and businesses or that finance health and safety, but the sums are inadequate to capitalize all start-up needs.

Capital strategies which enhance quality: In a market, incentives such as larger reimbursements to child care providers and loan forgiveness linked to quality rating systems can be used to improve learning environments.

The Center for Community Self-Help in North Carolina has made loans up to $50,000 per provider at five percent interest. Up to half of the loan may be forgiven if the provider maintains or increases quality based on the state's star-rated license system (http://www.ccshelp.org/whatsnew/pratras.asp). The organization reports that "To date, Self-Help has made over 190 loans for over $12.7 million to child care providers across the state of North Carolina, creating or preserving over 5,000 child care spaces."

D. Land & Infrastructure Strategies

Businesses depend on infrastructure. Possessing a solid transportation infrastructure, including railroads, highways, and airports, is a crucial component of economic development. Federal, state and local governments have long recognized this and have supported transportation infrastructure by building and improving roads and subsidizing public transport and other transportation initiatives. Federal grants devoted to transportation totaled over $36 billion in the year 2001 (U.S. Bureau of Transportation Statistics, 2003). Increasingly transportation planners are including attention to child care in their development strategies. Transportation dollars have been directed towards facilities financing and adaptive reuse of facilities for child care, as a means of reducing congestion, encouraging the use of public transportation, and building an important social infrastructure.

Child care is part of the infrastructure for economic development and as such can be incorporated in transportation and housing projects, tapping into a new source of public investment. Similarly, child care can be included in the land use planning process to facilitate new center development. Child care establishments have traditionally made efficient use of underutilized sites and can be included for financing under enterprise zones.

TRANSPORTATION & HOUSING FUNDING

Transportation Funding for Child Care Facilities

Florida and California are two states that have used transportation flexible funding to fund child care sites. By combining child care needs with transportation needs, communities can make child care more accessible (for example, siting a child care facility in or near a transportation hub), reduce commuting time for parents, alleviate congestion and pollution, and encourage the use of public transportation. Examples of TEA-21/US-TEA funding for Child Care include:


http://econdev.cornell.edu/
Housing Funding for Child Care Facilities

Similarly, flexible funding for housing can be used to increase accessibility to child care and reduce congestion. Locating child care in or near to housing developments reduces the number of daily trips parents must make, and allows children to attend centers to easily serve the local community. Examples of communities using HOME/VI funds for child care include:

- Housing Authority of Winston-Salem, NC, Kimberly Park Terrace Community and Happy Hill Gardens
  [http://www.cdhc.org/is/issue/winston-salem.shtml](http://www.cdhc.org/is/issue/winston-salem.shtml)
- San Francisco Housing Authority's Bernal Dwellings
  [http://www.sfaa.org/home/bernal.htm](http://www.sfaa.org/home/bernal.htm)
- Child Welfare League of America, 8 sites
  [http://www.cwla.org/programs/housing/housingaboutpage.htm](http://www.cwla.org/programs/housing/housingaboutpage.htm)
- City of Newark Housing Authority's Walsh and Knechtner Project Homies
  [http://www.nclcd Rutgers.edu/home.nj.html](http://www.nclcd Rutgers.edu/home.nj.html)
- Community Development Block Grant (CDBG)

The city of Colusa, California used a housing needs assessment to apply for a $350,000 CDBG grant to rehabilitate a prominent local building for the purpose of housing a child care center, the proprietor and her family. Sale of Colusa Housing Corporation bought the property and deeded it to the city for rehabilitation. The child care provider received loan assistance to purchase the site from Home Funds and a small business loan from a Community Development Block Grant. The Packard Foundation assisted in the acquisition of furnishings and equipment. The center has approximately 35 slots and 10 staff members.

[http://www.ruralsite.org/nmhc.html#overview](http://www.ruralsite.org/nmhc.html#overview)

Low-Income Housing Tax Credits (LIHTC) was expanded to include child care facilities in low-income housing developments. A designated corporate child care tax credit provides investors with a return on their investment in child care. The return comes in the form of federal tax credits spread over ten years based on the depreciable cost attributable to the low-income units of the project. (National Women's Law Center, 2001) [http://www.nwlc.org/pdf/ACatalogOfTaxBasedApproachesForFinancingChildCareAndAppendixRev.pdf](http://www.nwlc.org/pdf/ACatalogOfTaxBasedApproachesForFinancingChildCareAndAppendixRev.pdf, p.4).

LAND USE PLANNING

Land use planning is an important way that communities link land and infrastructure to economic development, usually through the sitting and permitting process. This process helps preserve property values and ensure a rational growth strategy critical to business competitiveness. Child care can be an important part of a community's land-use and economic development plans. Land use plans need not restrict development of child care, especially home-based care. To ensure appropriate stability in land use regulations, the LINC Project in California has developed a land use planning guide for local use (Wildbrant & Uppe, 2001) at [http://www.thecouncil.net/report.html](http://www.thecouncil.net/report.html).

In California, several cities are creatively using impact fees to fund child care centers. Impact fees ante the impact of private sector actions on services. Three California cities (San Francisco, Concord, and Santa Cruz) have established laws that require new real estate development projects to make space available for a child care center or pay an exaction tax to fund child care facilities. Santa Cruz uses these fees for a child care "loan" program, in which the loans are often converted to grants. Fees collected are held in a separate Child Care Trust Fund. In 1999, the Santa Cruz program had $165,000 available to fund child care facilities. For more information, see [http://www.nccic.org/pubs/confirmingmetrics.html](http://www.nccic.org/pubs/confirmingmetrics.html), or Child Care and its Impact on California's Economy at [http://www.ned.hc.org/summary.pdf](http://www.ned.hc.org/summary.pdf).

In Butte County, California, the Assessing Child Care Economics Needs and Transportation (ACCENT) project used transportation funding to quantify child care costs in Butte County and incorporate child care into local planning efforts. The study focuses on subjects linked with child care: the economy, service supply and demand, and transportation. Local child care, economic development, government, finance, and transportation professionals all participated in the project. [http://www.bceo.nies/accent/default.html](http://www.bceo.nies/accent/default.html)

Since 2003, child care has been a mandatory component of land use planning in Vermont at all levels. The state is currently developing a public-private partnership known as Building Bright Futures to "assure child care is integrated into the fabric of all Vermont communities" (Vermont Dept. for Children and Families, 2004).

**ENTERPRISE ZONES**

Strategies that focus on improving the productivity of land target economically depressed areas like brownfields and enterprise zones. Economic development agencies identify underutilized land and work with developers to redevelop downtown areas, abandoned factories and brownfield sites in order to make them attractive locations for local commerce and housing (Bartoli, 2003). Adaptive reuse of older buildings promotes economic efficiency and reduces sprawl (development of unused lands).

Typically enterprise zones are areas suffering from disinvestment that would benefit from certain types of business activity, job preservation, and job creation. Governments encourage business development in enterprise zones by offering incentives like low interest business loans, business incubator development, managerial training and counseling programs, utility discounts, tax abatement and credits, local infrastructure development, local regulatory flexibility, and workforce training programs. Enterprise zones also enhance community development by promoting child care and other social services for zone residents, upgrading public services, renovating housing, streets and public spaces, and enhancing education for zone residents.

New programs such as the New Markets Tax Credit that invest in distressed areas can be applied to child care. This tax credit ($15 billion over 7 years beginning in 2002) can include investments in child care. Most states have their own enterprise programs which offer tax abatements for industry or business development. Child care centers can be included in the financing of such sites.

The St. Louis (MO) Economic Development Council has initiated a child care facility with an 80 child capacity as part of a community revitalization program that includes commercial, light industrial and housing development. The center will be built adjacent to a MetroLink commuter train station. Contact Beth Noonan at St. Louis County Economic Council: bnoonan@stlouiscoc.com.
SECTION III
SUSTAINABILITY: LINKING THE SHORT AND LONG TERM

Economic development seeks to improve a local economy by protecting and enhancing the environment and quality of life. Incorporating the concept of sustainability into economic development promotes the simultaneous pursuit of economic prosperity, environmental quality, and social equity. Sustainable development has become an important guide for many communities that have discovered traditional approaches to planning and development are creating, rather than solving, societal and environmental problems. To incorporate the importance of sustainability and human development, businesses are adopting a Triple Bottom Line (TBL) approach to measuring performance which takes into account social and environmental factors, as well as economics. By adopting a TBL approach, businesses not only make a positive impact on the environment and society, but they benefit from overall improvements in business performance (Bowden, Lane, & Martin, 2001).

A. Quality of Life

Economic development officials believe economic development can be enhanced if the local quality of life of an area is improved. As modern industries, particularly those in the high-tech sector, make location decisions based on quality of life conditions, communities have extra incentives to invest in community development. A high quality of life also allows firms to recruit more productive workers and recruit workers at a lower cost (Blair & Coulson, 1995). Richard Florida argues that economic development should work to enhance the creative features of a community to improve the quality of life and attract a creative class of workers—those who work in creative fields such as technology and innovation (Florida, 2002) www.creativeseconomies.com. Creative features include open space, unique urban amenities, vibrant street life, performance venues, and well-received entertainments and restaurants. A visible child care infrastructure also improves the quality of life in a community and makes communities more vital places to live and work.

Figure T-4 Economic Development Principles - Sustainability

WHAT CAN COMMUNITIES DO?

Early care and education, work/life policies, K-12

infrastructure and quality of life

Human development

Tax credits to support families and encourage private investment in early education

Human development

Public/Private Partnerships

TARGETS OF INVESTMENT

PROMOTE COMMUNITY PLANNING, INNOVATION, AND SOCIAL SUPPORTS, COMMUNITY COALITIONS

Tax credits for families

Women have been entering the labor force in increasing numbers since the 1950s. In 1992, 76.8 percent of women between the ages of 35 and 44 were participating in the labor force (Kinscher, 1993; November; U.S. Bureau of the Census, 2004). A front page article in Time magazine (March 22, 2004) reported that among women with children under 6, labor force participation declined from 59 percent in 1997 to 53 percent in 2000, primarily among well-educated white women over 30 ("Care," 2004). The article claimed that poor quality of life and the lack of quality, affordable child care are the major causes of this drop-off. However, most research has found that the majority of women must work and child care is a sheer necessity (Kamnill & Hoffman, 2002). In order to promote and retain women's labor force participation, economic development must work to improve quality of life and address the child care needs of working women and families.

B. Human Development

At its core, economic development is about human development. In the late 1980s, the Nobel Prize winning economist Amartya Sen (1999) began to promote an approach to economic development that incorporated social and environmental aspects by emphasizing that economic development should work to develop human potential by enhancing education, health, and other social services. The work of Sen, other innovative economists, and the lessons learned from traditional economic development have led to the importance of considering human and social development in the economic development process (Schicklin, 2003). According to the Nobel Prize winning economist James Heckman, human capital investments in early childhood education and continuing investment in the education of children have the greatest return because younger persons have a greater chance over the course of their lives to reconvert the returns on their investments and skills into new skills (Hickman and Masten, 2004). W. Steven Barnett of Rutgers has invested multiple meta-analyses of preschool programs and found that such early intervention leads to improvements in the participants' future education, increases in their civic and pro-social behaviors, advances in their personal decision-making and household management (Massie & Barnett, 2003). The Invest in Kids Working Group focuses on youth human capital formation as a strategy for strengthening U.S. economic growth and job creation. They argue that providing the 1.4 million four and five year olds living in poverty in the U.S. today with two-years quality preschool at a cost of $25.2 billion, would warrant $754 billion in public budget savings thirty years from now through lower criminal justice costs, rising income tax revenues, and a more competitive labor force (Dugger, 2004).

C. Strategies to Build the Sustainability of the Child Care Sector

Community Coalitions

To develop a more systematic approach to early care and education, many communities have established local coalitions to ensure that every family in the community has access to quality affordable child care. These coalitions are public-private partnerships that combine the efforts and resources of local stakeholders to develop comprehensive solutions.

Tomkins County Early Education Partnership (New York)
The Tomkins County Early Education Partnership brought together representatives of business, government, philanthropic and social service communities to address the challenge of affordability. The Partnership was founded on three principles: every family should have access to quality affordable child care; child care staff should not have to subsidize the cost of care through unacceptably low wages; the Partnership will help all families pay for child care through a universal system which combines private, public, and charitable funds. (http://www.dyscouncil.org/EEP/EEP250/ont503page.htm)

The Metropolitan Council on Early Learning (Kanons Cay)
The Metropolitan Council on Early Learning (MCEL) works with an extensive network of community partners from the public and private sector to develop and implement an early learning system that supports families and prepares children for success in school. Leaders from businesses, elected officials, and education specialists provide strategic planning, advocacy, and funding (www.marc.org/mcel). The partnership is
building a systemic response to child care challenges by reaching four goals: to improve child care quality, raise wages of child care workers, enhance parent affordability, and provide parent education.

Early Childhood Development Initiative (Rochester, NY)

Early Childhood Development (ECD) Initiative is a coalition of non-profit, government, religious, and business leaders. The ECD community fund has taken a comprehensive approach to funding voucher programs, certification training, and the construction of child care facilities. ECD strives to build a community-based network to promote a self-sustaining child care sector. The initiative links government subsidies along with substantial contributions from the Rochester United Way, local foundations, and the Diocese of Rochester to create a more comprehensive approach to early childhood education. 

Parental Tax Credits

A variety of tax credits at the state and federal level have been established to help families purchase child care. These credits increase the resources available to families for child care expenses, expanding effective demand. Some tax credits are refundable and provide families with a cash refund, while others work as non-refundable tax credits that reduce the total amount of income tax a family owes. Families earning little or no income tax can still benefit if the credit is designed to be refundable.

Dependent Care Tax Credit (DCTC)

The federal DCTC is a tax credit designed to assist families in meeting the costs of child and adult care by allowing tax payers to offset a portion of their dependent care expenses against their federal income tax liability. It is available to families with employment-related child care expenses for children under 13 and is equal to a percentage of eligible child care expenses. Twenty-six states and the District of Columbia provide their own state-level version of the DCTC; and ten states have made their tax-credit refundable. A few states such as Maine and Arkansas have designed their credit to provide greater benefits to parents using high-quality child care, thereby creating market signals that encourage quality (www.nwic.org).

Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC)

The federal EITC is a refundable tax-credit that allows low income working parents to receive a tax credit against their income tax liability or a cash supplement if their taxable income falls below a certain amount. Seventeen states have developed their own version of the EITC, typically calculated as a percentage of the federal EITC. These tax credits provide families with additional resources that can be used for child care expenses (www.nwic.org).

Parental Leave Policies

Paid parental leave provides parents with the opportunity to take time off from their job to care for their young children without forgoing their paycheck. In addition to reducing family expenses for out of home care, paid leave also helps to build strong attachment bonds between parents and children. The Family and Medical Leave Act (FMLA) was approved in 1993 by Congress to grant working families the right to job-protected time. Parents can currently take up to 12 weeks of unpaid leave for childbirth, adoption, personal illness, family illness, etc. While the current law provides job security for the period of leave, most families cannot afford to take time off without pay.

The US lags behind most other advanced industrial countries in providing paid parental leave. Many parents would prefer paid leave, especially for infants.

- California has the most comprehensive law of all the states as it provides partial income replacement for up to six weeks a year for among other things, taking care of a new baby. Parents in California can get up to 55% of their salary during the six weeks (www.paidleave.org).
- Utah provides a $100 refundable tax credit to income-eligible families who provide full time, parental care to infants less than one year old (www.nwic.org).
- In a pilot program Minnesota used child care subsidies for mothers of infants to stay home with their children. The subsidy is at 90% of the state’s maximum rate paid to a licensed family child care provider for full time care of an infant and is available to those earning less than 290% of the poverty rate. Repealed in 2003 it has been reinitiated. [http://www.nationalpartnership.org/ portallib/3library/PaidLeave/StateRoundUp2004.pdf]

Business Leadership

There has been increasing interest from the business community in the value of early care and education. The business community also has been a leader in crafting “family friendly” workplace policies. (For more information see the Families and Work Institute at www.familiesandwork.org). The Committee for Economic Development (CED) is calling for Preschool for All (2002). They argue that all children should have access to high-quality pre-kindergarten classes. Not only is the CED calling for greater federal and state government investment and collaboration to make free, high-quality preschool available to all, but through policy analysis and strategic partnerships, the CED is supporting the business community to foster systemic improvements in early childhood investments and to help identify and disseminate best practices. The CED is also conducting an endorsement campaign seeking support from America’s business community to help build public understanding about the economic and social need for early childhood education (www.ced.org/projects/edoc/stances). Economic development depends on a comprehensive systemic approach to building high-quality early education infrastructure and partnerships with business can go a long way to help find the language and approach to achieve this goal.

The short term economic benefits to working parents and their employers are clear. The long term benefits to human development and the future workforce are also clear. The nation’s future economic productivity depends upon investment in child care as a critical social infrastructure for economic development. The challenge is to move forward. This guide provides the framework for articulating more clearly how quality child care and economic development are linked.
Figure T-5 Economic Development Principles & Strategies Linked to Child Care

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PRINCIPLES**

**TARGETS OF INVESTMENT**
- Attracting External Investment
- Promoting Business Competitiveness
- Technology & Information Management
- Labor
- Capital
- Land and Infrastructure Productivity
- Infrastructure and Quality of Life
- Human Development

**WHAT CAN COMMUNITIES DO FOR CHILD CARE?**
- Maximizing Revenues: Private Investors and Federal & State dollars
- Promoting Tourism, Services, and Individual Investors
- Industrial Recruitment & Tax Abatements
- Enhancing existing businesses (Clusters, Business Retention, Development, and Expansion)
- Job creation, Workforce Development, Education, Work/life policies
- Private Investment, Community loan funds, Community Reinvestment Act, Government loan programs, quality enhancement
- Physical and Social Infrastructure, Land Use Planning
- Tax Credits to support families and encourage private investment in early education

**APPLICATION STRATEGIES FOR CHILD CARE**
- Maximizing government transfers, partnerships with business
- Tax credits for individual investors in child care
- Tax credits for employers supporting child care
- Collective management strategies, Provider networks, consumer information
- On-site child care, subsidies, work/life policies, child care workforce supports and training
- Low-interest loans, start-up grants, tiered reimbursement
- Multi-use facilities, facilities financing, Flexible transportation and housing funds for child care, land use and zoning regulation
- Early care and education, work/life policies, K-12
- Promote community planning, innovation, and social supports, community coalitions
- Tax credits for families

---

**GLOSSARY**

- **Banks:** Banks provide loans and facility financing and can serve as partners for economic development of child care.
- **Brownfield site:** Abandoned, underutilized industrial or commercial site where expansion or redevelopment is complicated by real or perceived hazardous environmental contamination and/or pollution.
- **Business development:** A process in which agencies work with companies to create wealth and jobs by improving productivity.
- **Business clusters:** A business cluster is an alliance between individual organizations within the same industry with the goal of enhancing productivity.
- **Business Retention and Expansion (BR & E):** BR & E involves obtaining information on the needs of local businesses and then encouraging government actions to better meet those needs in order to increase competitiveness. Strategies typically include business visitation and surveying and free or low-cost consulting services.
- **Chamber of Commerce:** An organization of local businesses in which members use collective power to enhance communication, collective purchasing, and political voice.
- **Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF):** The CCDF is a federal block grant that allocates funds to states to increase the accessibility and quality of child care.
- **Child Care Resource & Referral (CCRR) agency:** Intermediary agencies that help assess community needs, develop supply, provide parent referral services, and help families make informed child care choices. Many CCRR agencies train providers in child development, health and safety, and business management and may manage government subsidies.
- **Collective management strategies:** Firms organize in networks or clusters to enhance efficiency through increased communication and shared administrative tasks.
- **Community development:** Cooperative, collective action taken by local actors to improve the long-term social, economic, and environmental conditions of their community, in order to create a better overall quality of life for everyone.
- **Community Development Corporations (CDCs):** CDCs are local organizations, typically non-profit, formed by residents, small business owners, congregations and other local stakeholders to revitalize a low and/or modest-income community primarily by improving housing and creating jobs.
- **Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFIs):** CDFIs are private-sector financial intermediaries with community development as their primary mission.
- **Community Reinvestment Act (CRA):** Enacted by Congress in 1977, the CRA encourages banks to help meet the credit needs of their communities for housing and other purposes, by reinvesting in the communities of their depositors.
- **Community Vision:** A set of goals and values important to community actors typically articulated in an economic development plan.
- **Dependent Care Tax Credit (DCTC):** Credit designed to assist families in meeting the costs of child and adult care by allowing taxpayers to offset a portion of their dependent care expenses against their federal income tax liability.
- **Early care and education:** The term early care and education encompasses child care and early education programs and providers.
- **Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC):** A tax credit for low-income workers based on their income and the size of their family.
- **Economic development policies:** States and communities use economic development policies to create sustainable, high quality jobs, by implementing strategies such as: industrial recruitment, business development, job training, and redeveloping underutilized sites.
Economic development planning: A process by which diverse actors in the community come together to set goals, clarify shared values, and delineate a plan by which to reach them. Economic development planning aims to create local job opportunities, enhance business productivity, and build the local tax base.

Effective Demand: A consumer's ability to buy in the market place.

Enterprise zones: Specific areas targeted for economic revitalization by a city or state, usually through tax breaks. Typically, enterprise zones are areas suffering from disinvestment, and which could benefit from certain types of business activity, job preservation, and job creation.

Environmental sustainability: Satisfying the needs of today without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their resource needs.

Exports: Goods or services that are produced in one locality and sold to and consumed in another. Exports can be to a neighboring locality, state, or another nation.

Flexible Spending Account: Employer-based program where employees deposit a portion of pre-tax wages into an account that can be used to reimburse dependent care or medical expenses.

Hope VI: Federal program providing grants and regulatory flexibility to address community housing and social service needs in order to revitalize the nation's most distressed public housing developments.

Human capital: Human capital is the stock of accumulated skills and experiences that improves a worker's productivity (e.g., education, work experience).

Human development: Strategies to enhance human capital and improve quality of life, which may include education at all levels, including preschool, K-12, higher education, and healthcare.

Impact fees: Fees charged to developers that anticipate the impact of private sector actions on public services. A common example is an impact fee charged to housing developers for infrastructure provision.

Industrial Development Agency: Quasi-public agency given the power to grant tax abatements to selected businesses to meet community economic development goals.

Jobless recovery: An increase in domestic output without an increase in employment. After the economic downturn in the 1980s, the economy rebounded during the 1990s through enhanced technology and productivity but failed to create a large number of quality jobs.

Market failure: Misallocation of resources in a market. Public goods and services, whose market failures are externality and free riders. Market failures must be resolved by regulatory intervention.

New Markets Tax Credit: The largest federal community development tax credit administered by the US Treasury Department's Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFI) Fund, to stimulate $15 billion in new capital investment in America's urban and rural markets to bring them into the mainstream economy.

Operating costs: Child care businesses face high operating costs, because the majority of their costs are labor and there are limited opportunities to substitute capital for labor (technological innovation) and still ensure quality care.

Parent productivity: Employers seek to enhance worker productivity. High-quality, reliable child care has been shown to decrease parent absenteeism and enhance productivity.

Physical infrastructure: Physical resources vital for human settlement and economic development. These include: water, sewer, roads, transportation, telecommunications, information technologies, housing, schools, parks, and offices.

Productivity: Promoting more effective use of the factors of production: land, labor, capital, and information, technology, and management.

Provider networks and clusters: Child care providers' organizations that use "power in numbers" to enhance communication, purchasing power, and political voice.

Public-private partnerships: The public sector (government) and the private sector (businesses, foundations, community groups) collaborate to enhance the quality, availability, and affordability of child care within a community.

Quality of life: The characteristics of the economic, social, and physical environment that make a community a desirable place in which to live or do business.

Research and development (R&D): R&D refers to the scientific and marketing evolution of a new product or service through basic and applied research in engineering, designing, developing, or testing prototypes and processes.

Revolving loan funds (RLFIs): RLFs are funds structured to use loan repayments to fund new loans. RLF capital comes from a variety of sources, including federal, state and local governments, as well as private banks, corporations, individual investors or foundations.

Social infrastructure: Systems supporting the human development of a community including education, housing, health care, culture, arts, parks and recreation.

Staff turnover: Child care workers and providers enter and exit the field often. The turnover rates for employees and home-based providers average between 20% and 40% annually.

Start-up grants: Child care providers are awarded start-up funds to assist in creating their businesses. These are primarily used to enhance the health and safety of facilities.

Subsidies: Subsidies provide financial support in child care. Direct subsidies are funds paid to child care centers and providers for quality enhancement, and rental subsidies are given to families to help pay provider fees.

SWOT Analysis (assessment of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats): Tool used in the planning process through which the participants analyze the community's economy in order to understand its potential and its weaknesses, as well as its resources.

Tax credits: Monetary incentives outlined in the tax code designed to encourage individuals or businesses to take particular actions in exchange for a reduction in taxes owed. Industrial Development Agencies typically provide the credit on an ad hoc basis to individual firms.

Transportation Equity Act for the 21st Century (TEA-21): Federal legislation authorizing federal highway, highway safety, transit and other surface transportation programs, one of the largest sources of Federal funding for states and localities.

Triple Bottom Line: A business performance indicator that measures, not just the economic value a corporation creates, but also how it impacts society and the environment.

United States Small Business Administration (SBA): The SBA acts in cooperation with State and Federal agencies to foster small businesses in a variety of ways, including facilitating technology transfer, enhancing small businesses' ability to export, and increasing the access of small businesses to long-term capital.

Venture capital: Money used to support new undertakings through equity, risk, or speculative investment capital. Venture capitalists typically take an equity position in new or existing firms which exhibit potential for above-average growth.

Work/life policies: Employers offer work/life policies to increase the quality of life of workers and to promote worker productivity. Policies can include on-site child care or flexible work hours.

Workforce Development Boards: Public-private partnerships, comprised of both local business people and civic leaders organized to respond to local hiring needs and promote workforce training. These boards often operate one-stop job service centers.

Workforce Investment Act of 1998 (WIA): Program reforming federal job training programs and creating a new business-government partnership structure, to ensure that businesses find the workers they need.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


